

## Facts about the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

### First Author (full first- and surname, no title)

Geert-Jan Koot

Research Services, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, Netherlands

g.koot@rijksmuseum.nl



Copyright © 2017 by Geert-Jan Koot. This work is made available under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License:

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>

---

### Abstract:

*Overview of the history and the benefits of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. This group catalogue is first international discipline specific discovery tool based on Worldcat. It brings together the bibliographic data from more than 60 art libraries in 15 different countries, but also the metadata from repositories and the Worldcat records. It enables discovery of aggregated bibliographic data from the participating libraries and unifies scattered indexes by simultaneous searching of over 1900 databases and millions of journal articles and e-books from WorldCat Central Index.*

*The Art Discovery is a discovery tool, showing the results from the configured group. When one of the libraries in the group has a holding on a journal, all the articles from those journals will surface in the results. To make the best use of the discovery engine, OCLC introduced the new user interface and experience for Art Discovery. Most important for our subject oriented catalogue is the improvement of the relevancy ranking by including the Library of Congress subject headings for art and history in the new best match default setting.*

*From 2010 onwards, the Future of Art Bibliography (FAB) group was looking for new ways of facilitating art historical research collaboratively. The FAB initiative resulted in the need for a discovery environment for discipline specific information and sources. The FAB group and the Artlibraries.net group joined forces to develop a common electronic research index as a power-plant for information research in art history. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue was launched in May 2014 after technical problems with its predecessor Artlibraries.net became unresolvable.*

*With bibliographical and digital repositories expanding exponentially, there need to be a technical solutions to help researchers find trusted information. Art Discovery is successful and keeps evolving, it could also relieve the need for libraries to purchase and implement expensive and untested commercial discovery products.*

**Keywords:** catalogues, art, art libraries, discovery, group catalogues

---

### Background: two “crises”

The idea to connect online catalogues of selected art libraries and to create a virtual bibliographic tool for searching discipline-specific information goes back to the late 1990’s. The first version of the Virtual Catalogue of Art History was launched in 1999. The catalogue unified the catalogue entries of the art historical holdings of two German universities and the Kubikat-consortium. By 2003 the first international partners, such as the Florentine IRIS consortium and the union catalogue of the French national museum libraries joined. The

network and its virtual catalogue were called artlibraries.net. In the following years the number of partners grew considerably to more than 90 libraries in 15 different countries. Also targets such as Google Books and the Hathi Trust were included.

The concept of a discipline-oriented, virtual catalogue of leading art libraries worldwide played an important role when discussions started in 2010 following the cessation of the publishing of the Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA).

Through conversations about the concern for international art bibliography funding, art librarians, art historians, publishers and information technologists in the American and European art historical community developed the Future of Art Bibliography (FAB) group. This group hosted international meetings to look for new ways of facilitating art historical research collaboratively. It was acknowledged that professional cooperation among scholars, librarians, and publishers was needed. The discovery of resources should be made much easier. The overall opinion was that we need to take advantage of what already exists digitally, in publishers' catalogues, in websites, in digital information that is available and to identify the gaps in what does not exist or is already discoverable.

The FAB initiative resulted in the need for a discovery environment for discipline specific information and sources. Part of the solution has been artlibraries.net, However, this system had limitations. This vision to create a new freely available virtual art bibliography, a common electronic research index as a power-plant for information research in art history, emerged at the same time as the second crisis, the technical shortcomings of artlibraries.net appeared as a result of its popularity and ongoing expansion. A number of challenges had to be faced:

- The sometimes slow and inflexible federated search technology had to be replaced by an infrastructure that corresponds better to the current habit of searching and navigating in comprehensive data pools;
- The demand for displaying a de-duplicated hit list with facet-based filtering options as well as different ranking criteria had to be satisfied;
- It was recognized as indispensable to interconnect the catalogue entries of the participating libraries with bibliographic data from additional sources such as repositories, bibliographies, publishers' archives, review databases, Open Access publishing platforms and e-journal collections;
- The final product of the described vision needed to be based on realistic, reliable and long-term financial and operational outcomes.

Concept: discipline oriented discovery tool

In 2013 the FAB Group joined forces with the Artlibraries.network Committee. Inspired by the Adamnet group catalogue, a successful cooperation between Amsterdam libraries and OCLC, conversations started with OCLC representatives. Step-by-step, a scenario for transferring the bibliographic data of artlibraries.net partners to WorldCat and unifying them with the already existing pool as well as with additional sources was developed. In May 2014 the new tool for discipline specific retrieval was launched. We called it the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. Queries for bibliographical information are satisfied with access to records of connected libraries. The retrieval, or the discovery process, is enriched with additional sources like bibliographical databases, foremost for journal articles, full-text repositories, and image collections. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue started with 30 participating libraries and currently about 60 libraries are connected, some individual, some through networks. Also important is the geographical division over 15 different countries which, in my view, are impressive.

What happened to Artlibraries.net? More and more libraries signed off during 2015. Not only the success of the new group catalogue but mainly because of the financial difficulties of the internet firm Janus Media that stopped maintenance of the interface, Artlibraries.net was shut down at the end of 2015.

Artlibraries.net was a meta search interface based on the technology of the Karlsruhe Virtual Catalogue (Virtueller Katalog Karlsruhe), which conducted a simultaneous search in a number of web catalogues. As artlibraries.net did not have its own database, it depended on the availability of target systems. Artlibraries.net produced standardized short-title hit lists.

The WorldCat data harvesting model offers significant advantages over the distributed search model. It enables a single, consolidated result set, better response times and a more robust search service. With the distributed search model there is a limited number of targets that can be effectively accommodated; this is overcome with the data harvesting model.

In this new model, there are two containers: the Worldcat database and the OCLC Central Index.

The metadata in the Worldcat database are:

- Library records
- Open Access Repositories

The metadata in the Central Index are:

- Article citations (ArticleFirst, CrossRef, British Library Serials, Elsevier, etc.)
- Provider collections (EBSCO, ProQuest, JSTOR, etc.)

The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is a “slice“ from both containers with a discovery interface. From the single result set it is possible to display facets for narrowing the results. The presentation includes thumbnail images and the scope of the display can be expanded, from group catalogue to libraries world-wide.

### Discovering the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

To demonstrate the importance of articles in the group catalogue, I would like to present a search on the author Jan Simane.

- No less than 55 results are displayed.
- On the first page of the result list there are 3 articles and one computer file displayed.
- The records numbered 7, 8 and 10 are all full text accessible. Record number 7 refers to an article in the French periodical Perspectives which is a free available open access journal. Having direct access to full text articles is highly rewarded by scholars and students.
- However, the records 9 and 10 refer to the same article ‘Viewpoint’ in Art Libraries Journal. The reason is that record number 9 is loaded from Kubikat as a separate record in WorldCat and number 10 by CrossRef indexed by the Central Index.

This example shows the display of articles in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. The basic concept is the display of those article records with holdings of a journal in one or more of the participating libraries. The holding information is based on ISSN. Since the journal Art Libraries Journal is held by one or more of the participating libraries, the article record is shown. The 800.000 Kubikat articles will become a source in the article citation sector of the Central Index in the near future.

I would like to search on the author with a more complex name structure Jan Daan van Dam,

- As a result 59 results are retrieved because the engine finds records on the separate elements of this name.
- Putting the full name between quotation marks gives a more precise result: 18 hits.
- An even more precise result list can be obtained by using of the filters: by choosing the two name variants offered: Dam, Jan Daan van, and: Dam, Jan Daniël van. Only 4 publications mentioning this name as the primary author are listed. The publications edited by Van Dam and written together with others are omitted from the result list.

One last search to demonstrate the use of filters and access to digitized texts: Albrecht Dürer.

- An impressive number of 8,321 hits on Albrecht Dürer
- On this screenshot I give an impression of the many different formats you might choose from.
- By choosing the format e-book 150 results are displayed.
- Clicking on the title *Albrecht Dürer: his engravings and woodcuts* the record is displayed. The electronic version is made available by three different providers. However, the Google option is blocked for copyright reasons. The Hathi Trust record links to two digitized books from the original at Princeton University digitized by Google and the original at the University of California digitized by The Internet Archive.
- The Internet archive option opens a new screen and the book is full-text readable and even downloadable.

The organisation of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

The Art Discovery Project has been developed by an international project group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the artlibraries.net committee acting as the core taskforce.

The relation to OCLC should be made clear. Art Discovery is a project of the international art libraries community, managed by the taskforce. Art Discovery is not a service provided by OCLC, but it is using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat. The libraries included in the group catalogue are proposed and accepted by the taskforce. As a result of using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat, libraries have to sign an agreement with OCLC and secondly pay an annual subscription fee and a one-time set-up fee to join Art Discovery.

Joining the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. How to become a partner?

If you are responsible for an art library wherever in the world and your holdings are catalogued following international standards in terms of cataloguing rules and data structure then send us a description of the collection profile. A request for becoming partner in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue can be made at any time in an informal way by contacting the project manager or one of the committee members. There is a “contact button” on the home page of the Artdiscovery.net website. Participating in the group catalogue is with costs, referring to a one-time fee for loading your data to WorldCat (if this is not already the case) and to an annual maintenance share. In both cases, the amount depends on the size of your library.

The initial prices were fixed by OCLC and are subject to an annual rise according to the price index of the Netherlands and exchange rates. A short overview:

1. Annual subscription fee

Categories 1 and 2 = libraries that meet all prerequisites through existing agreements with OCLC:

| Collection size | EUR 2014 | USD 2014 | EUR 2017 | USD 2017 |
|-----------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| < 10,000        | 358.75   | 484      | 370      | 499      |
| < 200,000       | 461.25   | 625      | 476      | 643      |
| > 200,000       | 666.25   | 900      | 687      | 927      |

Category 3 = libraries that have no current agreement for WorldCat on FirstSearch or (in EMEA) an agreement for visibility in WorldCat.org:

| Collection size | EUR 2014 | USD 2014 | EUR 2017 | USD 2017 |
|-----------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| < 10,000        | 871.25   | 1,176    | 898      | 1,212    |
| < 200,000       | 973.75   | 1,315    | 1,004    | 1,354    |
| > 200,000       | 1,076.25 | 1,455    | 1,109    | 1,500    |

This fee only includes participation in the WorldCat Group Catalogue. It does not include WorldCat on FirstSearch; it does not include cataloguing and does not include a metadata conversion or batch load.

2. One-time set-up fee

| EUR 2014 | USD 2014 | EUR 2017 | USD 2017 |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| 307      | 414      | 321      | 432      |

I will not go into much detail about the data loading procedures. There are two procedures:

1. Your records are already available in Worldcat. There will be a selection of titles for inclusion in the group catalogue based on the holdings of the library.
2. Your records have to be loaded in Worldcat. The process basically consists of:
  - Matching with existing records
  - Merging of holding information

Why joining: what is the added value

Why, if your results are already in WorldCat do you need to join Art Discovery? It does look like an extra layer of bureaucracy and costs that a lot of smaller or less financially endowed libraries would stay out of, even though their holdings would be a huge asset. There are several reasons why libraries should join. The ideological reason is to join forces with other art libraries worldwide to build on this collaborative bibliographic tool for art related research and make the range of coverage as broad as possible. Another reason is to make your collections more visible for art historians. A leading study by Ithaka S+R called Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians pointed out the specific desire of many scholars for a single discipline-based research tool. In my experience at the Rijksmuseum, curators and conservators rarely search separate bibliographic databases like the Art Index, the Bibliography of the History of Art and the International Bibliography of Art. Researchers simply forget about their existence, they do not remember where to find them, or it takes too much effort. Joining Art Discovery is all about adding value to your collections by bringing all bibliographic information together.

At several occasions, during Question and Answer sessions, questions about added value and specific benefits were pertinent. I list a few answers:

- First discipline-specific view of Worldcat records
- It enables discovery of aggregated bibliographic data from participating libraries
- Unification of scattered indexes by simultaneous searching of 1900 databases + millions of journal articles and e-books from WorldCat Central Index
- Searches are easily expandable to the whole of WorldCat
- Scalable – unlimited number of libraries and unlimited number of users
- Incorporating digital content such as archives and images
- Being part of Worldcat means automatically part of the development of the OCLC discovery tool
- Operational capacity to become an increasingly comprehensive tool for art history study, scholarship and research
- Providing good open access quality
- New approach which is coming from the art history discipline
- Participating improves the exposure of your records

The added value of ADGC is a lot more than just combining a group of art libraries in WorldCat and hoping we get relevant results, it's the community around it and the education it can provide which should make it really interesting.

#### Interface and search developments

Recently, OCLC introduced the new user interface and experience for Art Discovery. In the new experience, looks and feels have been improved. The geographical filter has been changed as well as the naming of the excluded libraries into Art Libraries (not University Art Libraries). Most important for our subject oriented catalogue is the improvement of the relevancy ranking by including the Library of Congress subject headings for art and history in the new best match default setting. The effect can be demonstrated by searching on the name 'Ulrich Pfisterer' resulting in 570 hits. Actually there are two persons named Ulrich Pfisterer represented in the ADGC: one writes about art historical subjects and the second is a cancer specialist. Because of this new ranking mechanism most of the records in the result lists are clustered: first the publications by the art historian are listed, further down the list the cancer studies are shown. There is an extra filter available: by excluding the university collections only 366 records remain, most from the art historian Ulrich Pfisterer.

In the Art Discovery Group Catalogue we only see results that are from the configured group. When one of the libraries in the group has a holding on a journal, all the articles from those journals will surface in the results. That's the reason we see so many articles, but also articles from journals that have no relation to art. As long as any member of the Art Libraries group has a holding on a journal those indexed articles will show up in the search results.

However, the 'problem' is not the 'predominance' of material from other disciplines but the concept of the discovery layer on WorldCat. If you like to have only discipline relevant results you have to filter out most of the Metadata in the Central Index. These co-called 'wrong' hits in this example are coming from databases like CrossRef, British Library Serials, Elsevier and others. But if we want to have the famous 'additional sources' in a discovery experience we can hardly renounce to search these sources.

FAST is an OCLC research project aimed at providing access to content by making better use of the available subject information. Implementation could be very helpful because the ADGC has so many subject headings.

#### Additional databases

In the earlier implementation the interface design paved the way to integrate databases to be searches separately like the SCIPPIO database of auction catalogues and the ACI Scholarly Blog Index. SCIPPIO is a gateway to more than 300,000 auction and sales catalogues from the sixteenth century to the present. The metadata of this important, license-based source are now searchable in the Art Discovery environment. This is a feature unique to the Art Discovery Group Catalogue.

The ACI Scholarly Blog Index provides access to blog articles written by researchers and academic organizations across a wide variety of disciplines. It is already listed in the interface and will be activated soon.

Most important is the integration of databases relevant for art historical research. We asked the Tokyo National Research Institute to integrate the Japan National Art Bibliography. The Institute for Cultural Properties in Japan is interested in adding their exhibition database. The Getty Research Portal, the BHA and RILA are also on our wish list.

Furthermore, repositories of interest and with a relationship to our discipline like image collections, museum archives and so on can be integrated in the discovery environment when certain technical and legal requirements are satisfied.

An investigation has started to exchange articles and to deliver electronic documents among participating libraries by adding the module Depasa to the Art Discovery Group Catalogue.

#### Use and feedback

|                 |             |
|-----------------|-------------|
| January 2016:   | 925 users   |
| February 2016:  | 1,538 users |
| March 2016:     | 2,307 users |
| April 2016:     | 2,151 users |
| May 2016:       | 1,979 users |
| June 2016:      | 1,885 users |
| July 2016:      | 1,664 users |
| August 2016:    | 1,734 users |
| September 2016: | 1,663 users |
| October 2016:   | 1,974 users |
| September 2016  | 1,663 users |
| October 2016    | 1,974 users |
| November 2016   | 2,472 users |
| December 2016   | 2,130 users |
| January 2017    | 2,179 users |
| February 2017   | 2,434 users |
| March 2017      | 2,264 users |
| April 2017      | 1,973 users |
| May 2017        | 2,281 users |
| June 2017       | 1,826 users |

Most users are from France, Germany and Italy, together almost 50%. The use is stable and reviews are positive but still scarce, although doubts have been expressed by scholars and subject specialists because of the lack of scope, the limitations of subject specific searches and the multiple listing of the same article records. Since the introduction a lot have been improved, especially in better search and sorting algorithms and a new and more user friendly search interface.

How valuable such a discipline-specific view into the larger WorldCat pool can be, will depend on the future use and development. I am hopeful that we will be able to expand the breadth of the group catalogue over time, both in the number of participating libraries, but also by adding on certain discipline-specific tools and more digital collections in order to move toward the vision of a central and global discovery system for art historical bibliography. Those 60 libraries from 15 countries have signed up to participate seems a strong vote of confidence that this project might be on the right track. I strongly believe that with bibliographical and digital repositories expanding exponentially, there need to be technical solutions to help researchers find trusted information. It is possible that if Art Discovery is successful and keeps evolving, it could also relieve the need for libraries to purchase and implement expensive and untested commercial discovery products.

Thank you for your attention and interest in Art Discovery.

Geert-Jan Koot

Project manager of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue on behalf of the international working group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the [artlibraries.net](http://artlibraries.net) committee acting as the taskforce. [Artdiscoverynet@gmail.com](mailto:Artdiscoverynet@gmail.com)

## Acknowledgments

The ADGC is a collaborative project developed by the Artdiscovery working Committee: Wendy Fish (Library Royal Institute of British Architects, London, Great Britain) [wendy.fish@riba.org](mailto:wendy.fish@riba.org), Sandra Ludig Brooke (Marquand Library of Art and Archaeology, Princeton University) [sbrooke@princeton.edu](mailto:sbrooke@princeton.edu), Véronique Goncerut Estèbe (Bibliothèque d'art et d'archéologie des Musées d'art et d'histoire de la Ville de Genève, Geneva, Switzerland) [veronique.goncerut-esteb@ville-ge.ch](mailto:veronique.goncerut-esteb@ville-ge.ch), Rüdiger Hoyer (Library of the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte, Munich, Germany) [r.hoyer@zikg.eu](mailto:r.hoyer@zikg.eu), Deborah Kempe (Library of the Frick Collection, New York, USA) [KEMPE@frick.org](mailto:KEMPE@frick.org), Paulo Leitão (Library of the Gulbenkian Foundation, Lisbon, Portugal) [pjleitao@gulbenkian.pt](mailto:pjleitao@gulbenkian.pt), Michael Rocke (Biblioteca Berenson, Villa I Tatti – The Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies, Florence, Italy) [mrocke@itatti.harvard.edu](mailto:mrocke@itatti.harvard.edu), Kathleen Salomon (The Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, USA) [ksalomon@getty.edu](mailto:ksalomon@getty.edu), Jan Simane (Library of the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florenz, Max-Planck-Institut, Florence, Italy) [simane@khi.fi.it](mailto:simane@khi.fi.it); realised by the OCLC representatives: Frank van Klaveren (OCLC Senior Implementation Consultant) and Eric van Lubeek (Managing Director, OCLC EMEA & APAC)

## References

Website designed for the Art Discovery Group Catalogue <http://artdiscovery.net>



Art Discovery Group Catalogue interface: <http://artlibraries.on.worldcat.org/discovery>

Adamnet Group Catalogue: <http://adamnet.worldcat.org/>

Artlibraries.net: <http://artlibraries.net/>

WorldCat database: <http://worldcat.org/>

Background articles and presentations by the committee members about Art Discovery Group Catalogue: <http://artdiscovery.net/art-libraries/>

WorldCat® Discovery Services, Content available through WorldCat Discovery Services  
28 October 2016 <https://oclc.org/content/dam/oclc/worldcat-discovery/contentlist.xls>

OCLC Member Stories, Rijksmuseum Facilitate Research through Group Catalogs  
<http://www.oclc.org/member-stories/rijksmuseum.en.html>

Press release 1 May, 2014: <http://oclc.org/news/releases/2014/201415dublin.en.html>

Video clip 26 August 2014: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Wzg8wqw7e58>

A shorter version was embedded on the second page of the OCLC 2013-2014 Annual Report:  
<http://oclc.org/en-US/annual-report/2014/our-members.html>

Ars Hoya, a blog from Georgetown University Library opens with: “The biggest art catalogue in the world. This May [2014] a federated search catalogue exclusively for art debuted in the US. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is huge, free, and works equally well for the research needs of both undergraduates or the advanced researcher.”

<https://blogs.commons.georgetown.edu/ajs299/2014/05/28/the-biggest-art-catalogue-in-the-world/>

Codart ezine, New Art Discovery Group Catalogue launches. International group leads project to bring together art library catalogues in WorldCat, Wednesday, 14 May 2014  
<http://www.codart.nl/news/1086/>

Martien Versteeg, Het drie vakken gebied, UBA-blog voor ACW, CI en KG (University of Amsterdam Library blog) Posts Tagged ‘Art Discovery Group Catalogue’ 23 May 2014.  
<http://martien128.wordpress.com/tag/art-discovery-group-catalogue/>

Ithaka S+R, Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians, 2014  
[http://www.sr.ithaka.org/sites/default/files/reports/SR\\_Support-Changing-Research-ArtHist\\_20140429.pdf](http://www.sr.ithaka.org/sites/default/files/reports/SR_Support-Changing-Research-ArtHist_20140429.pdf)