Dynamic Law Libraries: Access, Development and Transformation in Africa and the United States

Yolanda Jones
Library Director and Associate Professor of Law
Florida A & M University College of Law
Orlando, FL, United States
Email: Yolanda.jones@famu.edu

Caroline Ilako
Librarian (Academic)
Makerere University Library
Kampala, Uganda
Email: cilako@mulib.mak.ac.ug

Copyright © 2015 Yolanda Jones and Caroline Ilako. This work is made available under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported License: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/

Abstract:

Just as access to information is deemed as a fundamental human right, access to legal information is also a fundamental information access issue. Attorneys, law students and the general public require legal information for decision making. In both Africa and the United States, law libraries are at the forefront of processing, disseminating and transmitting legal information. However; access to this information is limited by factors such as inadequate physical books, physical access issues, legal literacy issues (information behaviour), and infrastructure. This paper will explore the intersection between information behaviour and access to justice. It will discuss US and Ugandan perspectives on legal information as a human right, the legal information needs of attorneys, and strategies and approaches that law libraries in US and Uganda have used to facilitate access to legal information. It will also highlight the Access to Justice Movement and some of the challenges of accessing legal information in both countries.

Keywords: Legal information, Access to Justice.
Introduction – Access to Legal Information as a Fundamental Human Right

This paper is based on the proposition that access to information is a fundamental human right. Law libraries play a central role in access and use of legal information. There are more similarities than differences between the US and African law libraries, particularly in common law jurisdictions. They share similar barriers such as funding, which impacts librarians’ efforts to provide access to legal information. While some librarians are focusing on access to legal information for members of the public, others are wrestling with issues of legal information access for attorneys and judges. In times of decreased funding there is more focus on collaboration and volunteerism to meet an ever increasing need.

Richard Danner, one of the leading scholars on how evolving information technologies are impacting law libraries, notes that access to legal information could be thought of as a human right. Danner states that there are strong information access themes in statements such as the Declaration on Free Access to Law; the Durham Statement on Open Access to Legal Scholarship; and general human rights statements such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. He also notes that the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights states that “Everyone shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information...”

Since Danner's paper was written, the 2014 IFLA Lyon Declaration on Access to Information and Development was issued, which in part states that "Equitable access to information, freedom of expression, freedom of association and assembly, and privacy are promoted, protected and respected as being central to an individual’s independence.” In keeping with the Lyon Declaration, the theme of this joint session states that "Ensuring free, open and timely access to legal information and legislative data is a key aspect of this broad effort, and it is fundamental to the establishment of democratic and equitable societies, governed by transparent and accountable institutions and based on the rule of law.”

SECTION A: US PERSPECTIVES

1.1.1 Legal Information Behaviour – The Intersection of Information Needs and Access to Legal Information in the United States

In the US there is much emphasis placed on access to legal information for members of the public. Although attorneys with solo or small practices are the large majority of legal practitioners in the US, they are not generally considered to have an access to justice issue, as the major legal database vendors such as Lexis, Westlaw, and Bloomberg Law all offer low price subscriptions to their services geared towards small law firms (and in turn, their clients). However, some argue that access to justice issues exist for smaller law firms and solo practitioners, particularly in rural areas. Issues of legal information access may also persist in the US criminal justice system, where prisoners have limited access to legal information, and public defenders often have issues of large caseloads, low wages and may have less access to information sources than their prosecutor counterparts.

When considering issues of equitable access, the nature of the attorney’s practice must be taken into account. It is difficult to know whether certain aspects of legal information behaviour would occur regardless of being able to afford legal database subscriptions.
Research by county law librarian Susan G. Fowler,\(^9\) supports the general belief that there may not be as much need for extensive legal database access in small firm practice. In her 2007 observational study, the top daily activity listed for the attorneys in small firms was the telephone. This was followed by technology and research, but the cases involved were often small amounts that did not justify the cost of extensive research. The small firm attorneys in the study only infrequently worked with librarian support for legal research tasks.

The limited geographic area in which the small firms practiced usually only necessitated basic state resources and appellate court ruling updates. Note that the Fowler study was cited by the Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010) article “Assessment of Legal Information Needs and Access Problems of Lawyers in Uganda”\(^{10}\) Given the citation, it may be inferred that at the minimum similarity was seen between small law firm practices in the US and law practices in Uganda.

More recently, a 2014 study of the research practices of solo and small firm attorneys by county law librarian J.D. Lawson described solo and small firm attorneys as a "forgotten demographic."\(^{11}\) Lawson noted that even though small firms are the majority of law practices in the US, they are not usually the subjects of studies in legal information behaviour. The study found that the solo practitioners and small firm attorneys who were likely to frequent the local county law library were more likely to use print and free web resources than their counterparts in larger firms.

Lawson acknowledged the possibility of a digital divide among attorneys based on ability to pay, but stated that access to legal information is not solely an economic issue.\(^{12}\) Less use of computer databases may be due to other factors such as the technical orientation of the attorney, and “reduced need for expensive databases due to efficiencies of small firm practice, increased experience, and reliance on professional networks.”\(^{13}\) Lawson stated that small practice attorneys in the US benefit from the repetitive nature of their practices and the fact that as over time attorneys gain experience and need to do less research. Over time, lawyers build repositories of forms, letters and other legal practice documents.

Paradoxically, there are legal information literacy issues in the US even when there is access to a wide spectrum of legal information sources.\(^{14}\) My 2008 ethnographic observations of law students in a farmworker legal aid clinic indicated that even in an information rich environment such as a well-funded academic law library, social contacts were often utilized as opposed to traditional research in print and electronic resources.\(^{15}\) There is research which suggests that this may be an issue of task complexity.\(^{16}\)

### 1.1.2 The Access to Justice Movement in the United States

Significant progress has been made in providing free web access to federal and state primary sources of law such as cases, statutes, and regulations,\(^{17}\) but barriers to free and open access to legal information still exist. Due to geographic location and/or lack of funding, there may be no access to county law libraries and academic libraries may have to fill the gap.\(^{18}\) Patrons may be homeless or otherwise in need of social services. Public libraries receive requests for legal information sources, but patrons face many challenges, perhaps most importantly understanding the legal concepts expressed in the documents and forms that they find.\(^{19}\) Also, due to unauthorized practice of law requirements libraries must provide
legal information as opposed to legal advice which is seen as being within the purview of the attorney.

There are many organizations which support access to justice in the US. The 2014 American Association of Law Libraries (AALL) Whitepaper “Law Libraries and Access to Justice” 20 discusses activities to assist people who cannot afford legal representation including collaboration and volunteerism; technology such as automated legal forms, access to non-automated legal forms and other information on legal information portals for non-lawyers; pro-bono volunteers; partnering with state legal services and legal aid organizations; providing spaces for brief lawyer and referral service consultations, partnering with law libraries or public libraries, and providing research guides and handbooks for non-lawyers. The Whitepaper also suggests that “Academic law librarians can also promote access to justice beyond graduation…” This is particularly applicable where graduates may return to the law school for help and assistance as they begin their law practice.

There are many examples of the types of access to justice activities discussed in the AALL Whitepaper. I will focus on libraries and projects I have encountered over the course of my career as a law librarian. My law library at Florida A&M University is an academic law library but also functions as the Orange County Law Library. We have public access database terminals for use on-site and public access Westlaw subscriptions. Our library provides guides to free legal resources on the web and is partnering with a local public library to do legal research instruction. As with many libraries, budget constraints increasingly require cutting print resources in favor of electronic access. While this is in line with our legislative mandate, members of the public may encounter barriers accessing electronic sources as opposed to print.

Many states are addressing the growing problem of low and middle-income Americans who cannot afford legal representation. For example, a Michigan Supreme Court Justice brought together lawyers, legal assistance groups, librarians and others as part of the Michigan Solutions on Self Help Task Force to help self-represented litigants. 21 As a result of their work a Michigan Legal Help website 22 was developed which contains official interactive and PDF legal forms, and has several affiliated "self-help" centers at various locations in Michigan, such as the self-help center at the Oakland County Law Library. 23 The Michigan Legal Help program also collaborated with Michigan law librarians to create the Michigan Legal Research Handbook for Non-Lawyers. 24 Legal research handbooks are available in other states such as California 25 and Illinois, 26 and state “Law Help” websites can be found at http://www.lawhelp.org/.

It should be noted that, while the US has many websites which provide public access to government and legal information, 27 the US still has yet to provide one single, easy to use digital gateway for accessing all United States federal and state law online. 28 Different groups are working on various aspects of this issue. Development of metadata standards for legal information is ongoing. The AALL Digital Access to Legal Information Committee (DALIC), 29 hosts the State Online Legal Information/National Inventory of Legal Materials initiative, in which "...volunteers researched primary legal materials in their states to determine if online legal materials are trustworthy and preserved for permanent public access." 30 AALL is also working towards the passage in each state of UELMA, the Uniform Electronic Legal Materials Act, which would require each state to preserve legal information in an online format that is authenticated and accessible to the public. 31 The Legal
Information Preservation Alliance (LIPA) is working with law libraries to ensure access to legal information for future generations.  

Digital archives and institutional repositories in the US are providing open access to legal information and especially to journal articles and legal commentary which in the past have not been as accessible to the public. Projects vary widely. The University of Georgia Law Library was an early adopter of institutional repository technology and provided leadership for many law libraries in this area. The Florida State University College of Law Library leads several digitization projects including Florida Statutes, Florida's Constitutions, and Florida Supreme Court Briefs and Opinions. Villanova Law Library in Pennsylvania maintains the official digital archive of Third Circuit court opinions. States are adopting free and innovative access to justice related services such as Cali A2J Author automated legal forms, which “walk users through a step-by-step question and answer process” and produces completed legal forms which can be filed with the court.

Finally, there are many unsung heroes, such as Ms. Janice Selberg of the Library of Michigan Law Library. Ms. Selberg is an example of a US librarian who helped to develop a law library in Africa. During 2009 she acted as a consultant for the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), to help develop a law library in the Southern Sudan. Ms. Selberg encountered several physical infrastructure challenges. Wifi was available, but there was no running water in some places. Donated law books were shipped from London but languished in port for a time before the UN could retrieve and deliver them. When the library was opened the public was also allowed access, but according to Ms. Selberg, “The public used the law library as a newspaper and tea drinking lounge. They also went there for air conditioning, which was a novelty. To them, it was a nice public place.”

A law librarian stated that "access to justice starts in the library." The law library provides access to legal information and develops the necessary skills that attorneys need to become a strong force for social justice. But the biggest barriers of all may be barriers of scholarly communication. Danner “argues that full understanding of authoritative legal texts requires access to informed commentary as well as to the texts of the law themselves, and that free and open access to legal commentary will facilitate cross-border dialogue and foster international discourse in law.” Open access to legal information is critically important to promoting access to justice and the rule of law.

SECTION B: UGANDAN PERSPECTIVES


“Unresolved legal problems can entrench disadvantage and increase social exclusion unless legal assistance is made available to members of the community.”

From the above quote, Legal information is supreme to the success of the legal system. Legal information is defined as the “requirement or right established by law, which resides in all electronics and written records”. The history of legal information is traced back in 1984 when Uganda was a colonial territory of the British with the first order being established in 1902 hence the formation of the legal system. This system, allowed the “native institutions based on customary law to exist only with the colonial legal system only if the
customs were not repugnant to justice and morality or inconsistent with any order in council ordinance”. Since then, legal information has continued to be produced regardless of how accessible they are to both the legal fraternity and the general public.

Access to information is the key element to development because it plays the key role in the organization, judicial and community efficiency and awareness. Legal information can be categorized as primary sources (acts of Parliament, decisions of courts & tribunals) and secondary sources which are the starting points of everybody trying to understand the law (Textbooks, dictionaries, Encyclopaedias journals etc.).

A research to identify the information needs of lawyers in Uganda returned worrying results, findings indicated that lawyers still had difficulty in accessing legal materials related to constitutional matters. These findings therefore leave one wondering what the future holds for the public who are not trained to access and use legal information.

The 21st Century is a period which has faced an information revolution from traditional libraries to digital libraries using OPACS, portals, and search engines to facilitate information retrieval. Due to the availability of many information sources, there is an increase in information overload, for information to continue being relevant, it must be retrieved in the right form and time. However, information needs of the users need to be identified so that they are met. Today the role of law librarians is to establish the needs of their users and recommend the library resources and systems that can be used to retrieve information.

1.1.4 The Access to Justice Movement in Uganda

A 2007 report by the Penal Reform International and the Bluhm Legal Clinic of the Northwestern University School of Law Chicago, Illinois notes that adequate access to legal information to both legal fraternity and those who cannot afford lawyers is an international problem. The African Innovation Foundation (AIF) in partnership with the Law librarian at Makerere University and Supreme Court are working at providing free Africa legal information to the public. The role of the librarian in this project is mainly to collect and archive legal information into the ALL repository for open access. However, many African countries like Uganda are still facing infrastructure problems of basic internet access, power fluctuations and high illiteracy rates among especially those living in the villages which will be discussed later in this paper.

The Uganda Legal Information Institute is another internet facility that provides free access to legal information to the general public and the legal fraternity, it archives legal information from the public bodies such as Parliament, Justice Law and Order Sector (JLOS), Uganda Law Reform Commission (ULRC) etc.

With the establishment of library associations such as Uganda Law Libraries Association (ULLA), Consortium of Uganda University Libraries (CUUL) there has been a remarkable increase in information literacy and more so legal literacy. Registration to these associations enable users from the registered university access information from any registered library without prior payment. However, it should be noted that this only applies to students but not the public. The general public can access the libraries at a few which may not be cost effective for especially the poor. The Makerere university Institutional repository (MAKIR) has also promoted the use of free access to legal information to the public.
A number of free legal sites have been developed which contain legislation passed by the Republic of Uganda and the parliament. Although there are many initiatives put up to facilitate free access to legal information, there are still many barriers hindering this access in Uganda, and these are explained in the next section.

1.1.5 Barriers to access to legal information

The inability of accessing information via ICTs maybe as a result of inadequate or lack of ICT infrastructure.\textsuperscript{47} It is important to note that the provision of good infrastructure does not necessarily guarantee an increase in ICT usage although the availability of the ICT equipment and infrastructure such as reliable power are regarded as a positive step towards encouraging new methods of accessing legal information.\textsuperscript{48}

Lack of access to appropriate resources such as software, hardware and internet access limit the usage of ICTs and information access via these ICTs.\textsuperscript{49} Technology and globalization have compelled communities to adapt to new technology in order to be competitive, to survive, and to be successful through the use of information and communication technology. Therefore, to have a poor and inefficient ICT infrastructure leads to digital divide.

Lawyers and law students have the poorest research skills especially when it comes to using online resources, they would prefer using resources that are highly convenient to them.\textsuperscript{50} A study by Andrews conducted to find out the usage of LexisNexis & Westlaw databases by the professionals, revealed that the interface of the digital law libraries actually hindered online usage.\textsuperscript{51} This because users are not familiar with the databases since some of them are novice users\textsuperscript{52} and some of them get skills from colleagues who may not provide an in depth explanation.\textsuperscript{53} This statement is in agreement by Vasanthi,\textsuperscript{54} her study revealed that information seeking of students were influenced by people like lecturers and colleagues etc., findings stated that 96\% of the academic staff were consulted by the students on how they can have access to resources. However, another study by George et al\textsuperscript{55} reported that most graduate students were helped by Librarians. From the above statement therefore, the role of law librarians in promoting the access to legal information is still appreciated among the students, lawyers and also the general public.

Research by Saravani & Haddow\textsuperscript{56} stated that lack of training in digital literacy, lack of pedagogic and training in how to use ICTs and other technologies were barriers to using new technologies for any purpose. Training therefore is a necessity if people are to develop the required skills and competence in using ICTs for information access.\textsuperscript{57}

With all the technological advancement and availability of relevant information on the internet, Law librarians should ensure that their users have the skills to access and use these resources for their research and assignments. It is the duty of the information providers to ensure that information needs of their users are met, and they can only be met by helping the users identify and user the relevant information. Marketing of e-resources is another important duty that the law librarians should do in order to create awareness of their existence.
Copyright issues in Uganda too have played a crucial role in limiting access to legal information. Two articles of the 2006 Act directly address the question of access to public information. Article 7 subsection 1) on Public Benefit works stipulates that:

1) The right to protection of copyrights under this Act shall not extend to the following works:

   a) An enactment including an Act, Statute, Decree, statutory instruments or other law made by the Legislature or other authorized body;
   b) Decrees, orders and other decisions of courts of law for the administration of justice and any official translations from them.
   c) A report made by a committee or commission of inquiry appointed by Government or any agency of Government.
   d) News of the day, namely reports of fresh events or current information by the media whether published in a written form, broadcast, internet or communicated to the public by any other means

2) Article 7 states that: The Government shall be the trustee for the public benefit of the works specified in subsection (1).

From the above articles, certain works are excluded from copyright laws and ownership is assigned to the government. Article 8 states that:

“Where a person creates work under the direction or control of the Government or a prescribed international body, unless agreed otherwise, the copyright in respect of that work shall vest in the Government or international body.” According to Nicholson & Kawooya (2008), the combination of Article 7 & 8 gives the government full control of public domain information and this information is not freely given out to the general public as a national security measure.

Universities and organizations have limited resources to even satisfy the needs of their users therefore it’s difficult to satisfy the needs of the public/society who are not their direct users. Although libraries around the country encourage external users, this is only possible by subscription. With the poverty issues in Uganda and the high illiteracy levels, little or no subscription is expected especially from the rural population. To this end, prevailing poverty and its attendant restriction on mobility limits access to legal services and as such occasions injustice.

In most developing countries, over 70% of their population live in rural areas and they are mostly illiterate or semi-literate. Most of the legal resources in the country are in English therefore many of the Ugandan population can’t access or use this information in the courts of law but only depend on the interpretation by their lawyers. This has affected the especially women in accessing justice.

1.1.6 Lessons learnt

Creativity and innovation - Law librarians should be proactive and introduce need systems that can facilitate access to legal information to the public and not only their intended users. They should explore the possibility of partnership with existing organizations working with the public. Law librarians should create a relationship and partner with these organizations to provide free access to legal information to the public.
Skills - Law

Law librarians in Uganda most of whom are not legally qualified must familiarize with the law so as to meet the legal information needs of their users. Further, they should also know how to deliver information in all formats.65

Training - According to Virgo Graham66 law librarians should assist, support and guide law students to develop legal skills by providing training on the use of especially digital materials in this way they will help develop information literate lawyers.

Mobile technologies67 should be taken advantage of to provide legal awareness to the public especially those in the rural areas of the country.

1.1.7 Conclusion

Many themes from the past will influence the law libraries activities and services. Information technology has hastened the way of delivery and usage hence changing the information behaviour of the legal information users. Law librarians in US and Uganda should be aware of the wider issues at hand, involving their country, people and the economy.68 While, there are more similarities between US and Uganda when it comes to free access to the legal information, the two countries are still faced with challenges that are beyond the individual librarians to handle. However, the legal profession in both countries should take into account that, judicial systems are knowledge intensive and the attorneys, judges, students and the public are required to apply a lot of theoretical information while in court69 for that reason our role as Law librarians is to provide the right information at the right time. “Just in time information”.70

For librarians, access has always been linked to transformation, as methods of access evolve over time. The challenges are daunting, but librarians are up to the task, for as long as there have been laws. Whether in African nations such as Uganda or in the United States, law libraries are a force for transformation and justice as they provide free and open access to legal information sources now and in the future.

---

2 See http://www.worldlii.org/worldlii/declaration/.
3 https://cyber.law.harvard.edu/publications/durhamstatement
6 http://conference.ifla.org/ifla81/node/1019


For example, the Cornell Law School Legal Information Institute (LII) was established in 1992 by Peter Martin and Tom Bruce, and pioneered the provision of free online legal information. It was the first of many LII's world wide. https://www.law.cornell.edu/

For example, the Wayne State Arthur Neef Law Library in Detroit Michigan serves such a role following the closure of the local county law library.


http://www.sostf.org/

http://michiganlegalhelp.org/

http://oakland.michiganlegalhelp.org/


http://www.aallnet.org/mm/Leadership-Governance/committee/activecmtes/dali.html

http://community.aallnet.org/DigitalAccessAndLegalInformationCommittee/StateOnlineLegalInformation


http://lipalliance.org

See, for example the bepress institutional repository service (http://www.bepress.com) and their http://lawreviewcommons.com/.

http://www.cali.org/content/a2j-author.

http://www.americanbar.org/groups/international_law/initiatives_awards/international_legal_resource_center.html


40 Harvey, W.B., Introduction to the legal system in East Africa. Literature Bureau (1975).

41 Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).


43 Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).


45 See www.uli.org.

46 See http://makir.mak.ac.ug/.


48 See Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).


54 See George et al, scholarly use of information: graduate students information seeking behaviour. (2006). Available http://repository.cmu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1021&context=lib_science


58 Article 7(1)

59 Article 7(2)

60 Article 8

61 Article 8


67 Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).

68 Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).

69 Tuhumwire & Okello-obura (2010).